

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-07516-LAK**

Behar v. Department of Homeland Security  
Assigned to: Judge Lewis A. Kaplan  
Related Case: 1:17-cv-08153-LAK  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 08/17/2018  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff****Richard Behar**

represented by **John Langford**  
Yale Media Freedom & Information Access Clinic  
P.O. Box 208215  
New Haven, CT 06520  
203-436-5831  
Fax: 203-432-3034  
Email: [john.langford@yale.edu](mailto:john.langford@yale.edu)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**Department of Homeland Security**  
**TERMINATED: 08/21/2018**

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**  
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.)  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 637-2200  
Fax: (212) 637-2686  
Email: [sarah.normand@usdoj.gov](mailto:sarah.normand@usdoj.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant****U.S. Department of Homeland Security**

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/17/2018	<u>1</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR – COMPLAINT</b> against U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-15465774) Document filed by Richard Behar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E)(Langford, John) Modified on 8/20/2018 (jgo). (Entered: 08/17/2018)
08/17/2018	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Langford, John) (Entered: 08/17/2018)
08/17/2018	<u>3</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Richard Behar. (Langford, John) Modified on 8/20/2018 (jgo). (Entered: 08/17/2018)
08/20/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney John Langford. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: Department of Homeland Security. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party name contained a typographical error;.</b> (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)

08/20/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney John Langford to RE-FILE Document No. <u>1</u> Complaint. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): due to party modification, the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected;. Re-file the pleading using the event type Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents – attach the correct signed PDF – select the individually named filer/filers – select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)</b>
08/20/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY TO ELECTRONICALLY FILE RELATED CASE STATEMENT. Notice to Attorney John Langford, for non compliance with Local Rule 13 of the Division of Business Among Judges. Attorney must electronically file the Related Case Statement. Use the event type Statement of Relatedness found under the event list Other Documents. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)</b>
08/20/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING CIVIL CASE OPENING STATISTICAL ERROR CORRECTION: Notice to attorney John Langford. The following case opening statistical information was erroneously selected/entered: County code New York;. The following correction(s) have been made to your case entry: the County code has been modified to XX Out of State;. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)</b>
08/20/2018		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above-entitled action is assigned to Judge Unassigned. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018		Case Designated ECF. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018		CASE REFERRED TO Judge Lewis A. Kaplan as possibly related to 17-cv-8153. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018	<u>4</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR – AMENDED COMPLAINT</b> amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against Department of Homeland Security.Document filed by Richard Behar. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E)(Langford, John) Modified on 8/21/2018 (sj). Modified on 8/21/2018 (laq). (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018	<u>5</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Langford, John) (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018	<u>6</u>	STATEMENT OF RELATEDNESS re: that this action be filed as related to Civil Case No. 17-cv-8153 (LAK). Document filed by Richard Behar.(Langford, John) (Entered: 08/20/2018)
08/20/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney John Langford to RE-FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): party name on 'as to' docket entry text, pdf case caption and pdf 'To' section does not match initial pleading caption;; Re-file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (jgo) (Entered: 08/20/2018)</b>
08/21/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney John Langford to RE-FILE Document No. <u>4</u> Amended Complaint,. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected – YOU MUST ADD THE NEWLY NAMED PARTY. Re-file the pleading using the event type Amended Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents – attach the correct signed PDF – select the individually named filer/filers – select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against. (laq) (Entered: 08/21/2018)</b>
08/21/2018	<u>7</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>4</u> Amended Complaint, <u>1</u> Complaint, against U.S. Department of Homeland Security.Document filed by Richard Behar. Related document: <u>4</u> Amended Complaint, <u>1</u> Complaint,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E)(Langford, John) (Entered: 08/21/2018)

08/21/2018	<u>8</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>7</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Richard Behar. (Langford, John) (Entered: 08/21/2018)
08/22/2018	<u>9</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (sj) (Entered: 08/22/2018)
09/13/2018		CASE ACCEPTED AS RELATED. Create association to 1:17-cv-08153-LAK. Notice of Assignment to follow. (wb) (Entered: 09/13/2018)
09/13/2018		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Lewis A. Kaplan. Judge Unassigned is no longer assigned to the case. (wb) (Entered: 09/13/2018)
09/13/2018		Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (wb) (Entered: 09/13/2018)
09/25/2018	<u>10</u>	ANSWER to <u>7</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Homeland Security.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 09/25/2018)
10/01/2018	<u>11</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (25 in 1:17-cv-08153-LAK) Letter filed by Richard Behar. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. SO ORDERED. (Cross Motions due by 10/31/2018, Motions due by 10/3/2018, Responses due by 10/31/2018, Replies due by 11/21/2018.) (Signed by Judge Lewis A. Kaplan on 9/30/2018) (jca) (Entered: 10/01/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Department of Homeland Security. Responses due by 10/31/2018(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>13</u>	DECLARATION of Kim E. Campbell in Support re: <u>12</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>14</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>12</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Department of Homeland Security. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
11/16/2018	<u>15</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Reply and Opposition to Plaintiff's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Lewis A. Kaplan from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated November 16, 2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 11/16/2018)
11/19/2018	<u>16</u>	JOINT STIPULATION AND ORDER: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between plaintiff and the government, that: 1. The Secret Service shall file its combined reply and opposition to plaintiff's cross-motion by November 28, 2018, and Plaintiff shall file his reply in further support of his cross-motion by December 24, 2018. SO ORDERED. (Responses due by 11/28/2018, Replies due by 12/24/2018.) (Signed by Judge Lewis A. Kaplan on 11/19/2018) (jca) (Entered: 11/19/2018)
11/28/2018	<u>17</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>12</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 11/28/2018)
11/28/2018	<u>18</u>	DECLARATION of AUSA Sarah S. Normand in Support re: <u>12</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Declaration filed in Doyle v. DHS, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Plaintiff's Third FOIA Request, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: 2/21/18 Joint Stipulation and Order, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: 8/24/18 USSS Letters to Plaintiff, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E: 8/24/18 USSS Letters to Plaintiff)(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 11/28/2018)